

Environment and Sustainability Committee

Meeting Venue: **Committee Room 3 – Senedd**

Meeting date: **Wednesday, 18 March 2015**

Meeting time: **08.45 – 12.30**

This meeting can be viewed on [Senedd TV](http://senedd.tv/en/2638) at:
<http://senedd.tv/en/2638>

Cynulliad
Cenedlaethol
Cymru

National
Assembly for
Wales



Concise Minutes:

Assembly Members:

Alun Ffred Jones AM (Chair)
Mick Antoniw AM
Mike Hedges AM (In place of Jeff Cuthbert AM)
Russell George AM
Llyr Gruffydd AM
Julie Morgan AM
William Powell AM
Jenny Rathbone AM
Antoinette Sandbach AM
Joyce Watson AM

Witnesses:

Carl Sargeant AM, The Minister for Natural Resources
Neil Hemington, Welsh Government
Sarah Dawson, Welsh Government

Committee Staff:

Alun Davidson (Clerk)
Peter Hill (Deputy Clerk)
Lisa Salkeld (Legal Adviser)

TRANSCRIPT

View the [meeting transcript](#).

1 Introductions, apologies and substitutions

Apologies were received from Jeff Cuthbert. Mike Hedges attended as a substitute.

2 Planning (Wales) Bill: Stage 2 – Consideration of amendments

In accordance with Standing Order 26.21, the Committee disposed of the following amendments to the Bill:

Amendment 61 (William Powell)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|-----------------------------|---------------------|---------|
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mick Antoniw | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Russell George | |
| William Powell | Mike Hedges | |
| | Julie Morgan | |
| | Jenny Rathbone | |
| | Antoinette Sandbach | |
| | Joyce Watson | |
| 3 | 7 | 0 |
| Amendment 61 was not agreed | | |

Amendment 85 (Russell George) was withdrawn in accordance with Standing Order 26.66(i).

Amendment 128 (Llyr Gruffydd) was not moved.

Amendment 45 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 129 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 129 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 62 (William Powell)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---------------------|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 62 was not agreed.

Amendment 63 (William Powell)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---------------------|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 63 was not agreed.

Amendment 130 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---------------------|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 130 was not

agreed.

Amendment 131 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---------------------|----------------|----------------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 131 was not agreed.

Amendment 46 (Carl Sargeant)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---------------------|------------------|----------------|
| Mick Antoniw | Llyr Gruffydd | |
| Russell George | Alun Ffred Jones | |
| Mike Hedges | | |
| Julie Morgan | | |
| William Powell | | |
| Jenny Rathbone | | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | | |
| Joyce Watson | | |
| 8 | 2 | 0 |

Amendment 46 was agreed

Amendment 64 (William Powell)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---------------------|----------------|----------------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 64 was not agreed.

Amendment 132 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---------------------|----------------|----------------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 132 was not agreed.

Amendment 133 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---------------------|----------------|----------------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 133 was not agreed.

Amendment 134 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---------------------|----------------|----------------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |

| | | |
|--|---|---|
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 134 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 135 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 135 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 47 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 87 (Russell George)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 87 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 48 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 136 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|----------------|--------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |

| | | |
|--|----------------|---|
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 136 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 1 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 122 (Suzy Davies)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 122 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 137 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 137 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 138 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 138 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 139 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 139 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 88 (Russell George)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 88 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 89 (Russell George)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 89 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 90 (Russell George)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 90 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 49 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 91 (Russell George)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative | | |

(in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 91 was not agreed.

Amendment 92 (Russell George)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 92 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 50 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 93 (Russell George)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 93 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 94 (Russell George)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---------------------|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 94 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 141 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 141 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 142 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 142 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 143 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|------------------|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |

| | | |
|--|--------------|---|
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 143 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 144 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 144 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 95 (Russell George)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 95 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 96 (Russell George)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|------------------|--------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |

| | | |
|---|----------------|---|
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 96 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 145 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 145 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 65 (William Powell)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 65 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 66 (William Powell)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|----------------|--------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |

| | | |
|---|----------------|---|
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 66 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 146 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 146 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 123 (Suzy Davies)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 123 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 147 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|----------------|--------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |

| | | |
|--|----------------|---|
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 147 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 2 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 148 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 148 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 67 (William Powell)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 67 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 68 (William Powell)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 68 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 149 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 149 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 150 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 150 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 51 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 151 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 151 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 69 (William Powell)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 69 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 3 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 70 (William Powell) was withdrawn in accordance with Standing Order 26.66(i).

Amendment 152 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|------------------|--------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |

| | | |
|--|----------------|---|
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 152 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 153 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 153 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 154 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 154 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 71 (William Powell)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|----------------|--------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |

| | | |
|---|----------------|---|
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 71 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 124 (Suzy Davies)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 124 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 155 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 155 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 156 (Llyr Gruffydd) was not moved.

Amendment 157 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|-----------|---------|---------|
|-----------|---------|---------|

| | | |
|--|----------------|---|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 157 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 72 (William Powell)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 72 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 98 (Russell George)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|------------------------------|------------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Llyr Gruffydd | |
| | Mike Hedges | |
| | Alun Ffred Jones | |
| | Julie Morgan | |
| | William Powell | |
| | Jenny Rathbone | |
| | Joyce Watson | |
| 2 | 8 | 0 |
| Amendment 98 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 99 (Russell George)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|-------------------------------------|----------------|------------------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | Alun Ffred Jones |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| William Powell | Julie Morgan | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Jenny Rathbone | |
| | Joyce Watson | |
| 4 | 5 | 1 |
| Amendment 99 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 73 (William Powell) was withdrawn in accordance with Standing Order 26.66(i).

Amendment 100 (Russell George)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 100 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 101 (Russell George)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---------------------|------------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Llyr Gruffydd | |
| | Mike Hedges | |
| | Alun Ffred Jones | |
| | Julie Morgan | |
| | William Powell | |
| | Jenny Rathbone | |
| | Joyce Watson | |
| 2 | 8 | 0 |

Amendment 101 was not agreed.

Amendment 158 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---------------------|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 158 was not agreed.

Amendment 159 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---------------------|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 159 was not agreed.

Amendment 102 (Russell George)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---------------------|------------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Llyr Gruffydd | |
| | Mike Hedges | |
| | Alun Ffred Jones | |
| | Julie Morgan | |
| | William Powell | |
| | Jenny Rathbone | |

| | | |
|--------------------------------------|--------------|---|
| | Joyce Watson | |
| 2 | 8 | 0 |
| Amendment 102 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 103 (Russell George)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---|----------------|----------------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 103 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 160 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---|----------------|----------------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 160 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 161 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---------------------|----------------|----------------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |

| | | |
|--|---|---|
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 161 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 104 (Russell George)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|-------------------------------|----------------|------------------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | Alun Ffred Jones |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Llyr Gruffydd | |
| | Mike Hedges | |
| | Julie Morgan | |
| | William Powell | |
| | Jenny Rathbone | |
| | Joyce Watson | |
| 2 | 7 | 1 |
| Amendment 104 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 162 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 162 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 163 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|------------------|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |

| | | |
|--|--------------|---|
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 163 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 164 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 164 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 165 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 165 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 166 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|------------------|--------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |

| | | |
|--|----------------|---|
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 166 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 167 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 167 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 52 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 168 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 168 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 169 (Llyr Gruffydd) was not moved.

Amendment 170 (Llyr Gruffydd) was not moved.

Amendment 171 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--------------------------------------|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Jenny Rathbone | |
| | Joyce Watson | |
| 4 | 5 | 0 |
| Amendment 171 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 172 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 172 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 53(Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 173 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--------------------------------------|---------------------|---------|
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mick Antoniw | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Russell George | |
| William Powell | Mike Hedges | |
| | Julie Morgan | |
| | Jenny Rathbone | |
| | Antoinette Sandbach | |
| | Joyce Watson | |
| 3 | 7 | 0 |
| Amendment 173 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 105 (Russell George)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 105 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 106 (Russell George)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 106 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 174 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 174 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 107 (Russell George)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---------------------|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 107 was not agreed.

Amendment 176 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---------------------|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 176 was not agreed.

Amendment 108 (Russell George)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---------------------|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 108 was not

agreed.

Amendment 177 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---------------------|----------------|----------------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 177 was not agreed.

Amendment 178 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---------------------|----------------|----------------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 178 was not agreed.

Amendment 179 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---------------------|----------------|----------------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative

(in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 179 was not agreed.

Amendment 180 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---------------------|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 180 was not agreed.

Amendment 181 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---------------------|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 181 was not agreed.

Amendment 182 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---------------------|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 182 was not agreed.

Amendment 183 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---------------------|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 183 was not agreed.

Amendment 4 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

As amendment 4 was agreed, amendments 184, 185, 186 and 187 (Llyr Gruffydd) fell.

Amendment 109 (Russell George)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---------------------|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 109 was not agreed.

Amendment 188 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|----------------|--------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |

| | | |
|--|----------------|---|
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 188 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 189 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 189 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 110 (Russell George)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--------------------------------------|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Jenny Rathbone | |
| | Joyce Watson | |
| 4 | 5 | 0 |
| Amendment 110 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 111 (Russell George)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|------------------|--------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |

| | | |
|---|----------------|---|
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 111 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 112 (Russell George)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---|----------------|----------------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 112 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 29 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 30 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 31 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 32 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 33 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 34 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 35 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 36 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 37 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 38 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 39 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 125 (Suzy Davies)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 125 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 190 (Llyr Gruffydd)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 190 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 40 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 113 (Russell George)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|---------------------|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |

| | | |
|--|---|---|
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 113 was not agreed. | | |

Amendment 54 (Carl Sargeant)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--------------------------|---------------------|----------------|
| Mick Antoniw | Russell George | William Powell |
| Mike Hedges | Llyr Gruffydd | |
| Julie Morgan | Alun Ffred Jones | |
| Jenny Rathbone | Antoinette Sandbach | |
| Joyce Watson | | |
| 5 | 4 | 1 |
| Amendment 54 was agreed. | | |

Amendment 114 (Russell George)

| In favour | Against | Abstain |
|--|----------------|---------|
| Russell George | Mick Antoniw | |
| Llyr Gruffydd | Mike Hedges | |
| Alun Ffred Jones | Julie Morgan | |
| William Powell | Jenny Rathbone | |
| Antoinette Sandbach | Joyce Watson | |
| 5 | 5 | 0 |
| As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 114 was not agreed. | | |